



## DELIBERATIONS OF 22-07-2009

**Date: 22nd July, 2009**

STATES OF ALDERNEY, DELIBERATIONS OF THE MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY 22ND JULY 2009 AT 17:30 HOURS

Present:

Sir Norman Browse

Mr R Willmott

Mr W Walden

Mr C Williams

Mr I Tugby

Mrs E Bennett

Mr A Llewellyn

Mr P Allen

Mr B Kelly

Mr G Sargent

Mr J Beaman

Mr J Richards represented His Excellency The Lieutenant-Governor of the Bailiwick of Guernsey.

### Item I - Commercial Quay Upper Berth Survey

The States resolved to approve:-

The appointment of Halcrow Group Limited to carry out an initial survey on the Commercial Quay Upper Berth at a capital cost of £68,000.

(Proposed by Mr Willmott and seconded by Mr Williams.)

(Approved by a majority. All in favour except Messrs Tugby and Beaman who voted against.)

The increase in financial approval limit by the States of Alderney in respect of Capital expenditure from £50,000 to £100,000.

(Proposed by Mr Willmott and seconded by Mr Williams.)

(Approved by a majority. All in favour except Messrs Allen and Beaman who voted against.)

### Item II - Fort Quesnard Battery

The following amendment was proposed by Mr Willmott and seconded by Mr Williams:

After the word Battery insert the word may.

(Approved by a majority. All in favour except Mr Allen who abstained and Messrs Kelly and Beaman who voted against.)

The following amendment was proposed by Mr Kelly and seconded by Mr Beaman:

Amend the words be sold for the sum of to read to be sold for a sum of not less than

(Approved by a majority. All in favour except Mr Allen who abstained.)

The proposition as amended was then voted on:-

The States resolved that the Fort Quesnard Battery may be sold for a sum of not less than £400,000 and that the Chief Executive be instructed to negotiate terms, including as to the use of the Battery and public access, based on those in the existing lease, to be approved by the Policy and Finance Committee.

(Proposed by Mr Willmott and seconded by Mr Williams.)

(Approved by a majority. All in favour except Mr Allen who voted against.)

### **Item III - The Alderney Road Traffic and Public Highways (Amendment) Regulations, 2009**

The States resolved that The Alderney Road Traffic and Public Highways (Amendment) Regulations, 2009 not be annulled.

(Proposed by Mr Walden and seconded by Mr Kelly.)

(Approved by a majority. All in favour except Messrs Tugby, Allen and Beaman who voted against.)

### **Item IV - The Housing (Exemptions) (No.4) (Alderney) Ordinance, 2009**

Item withdrawn.

### **Item V - The Housing (Exemptions) (No.5) (Alderney) Ordinance, 2009**

Item withdrawn.

### **Item VI - The Digital Switchover (Disclosure of Information) (Guernsey and Alderney) Law, 2009**

The States resolved to approve The Digital Switchover (Disclosure of Information) (Guernsey and Alderney) Law, 2009.

(Proposed by Mr Beaman seconded by Mr Kelly.)

(Approved unanimously.)

## Item VII - Questions and Reports

Mr Williams reported on the Commercial Quay Project:-

In Billet Item I this evening, we discussed the Upper Berth or landward end of the Commercial Quay. This report updates one I gave in December States on the Lower Berth, or seaward end of the Commercial Quay.

In December, I noted we had a very tight budget of £9.5M, intended to keep maximum pressure on costs. Also, that a deep Trench and the old German Jetty foundations would add an estimated £800K to the cost of the project. The extra cost was £900K, giving an indication of the scale of the problem. Since then other issues have arisen. £250K of changes have been necessary. One example is the pre-cast deck edge units connecting the walls to the quay. Here the proposed 3 part design had to be replaced by a thicker single component because of difficulties in installation. This added £70K.

Another is the North Wall fender where, to minimise cost, we planned to use the old fender. This has not proved possible and the new fender required will cost £80K. Expensive items.

The next problem arose over the huge anchor beam that runs down the spine of the quay. The oil pipeline, supplying heating and electricity generating oil to the island, runs over this beam. The height of the new concrete block quay walls was chosen to allow the tie bars locking the walls together, to pass safely over the top of the pipeline with adequate clearance, and to provide a sufficient depth of concrete deck above that.

Unfortunately, the existing height of the Upper Berth was based on incorrect data provided in 2005. So, when the height of the new Lower Berth walls was calculated at the start of the project, the need for a thicker concrete deck to join the two berths together was not appreciated. Had it been so, an additional £200K would have had to be added to the budget.

There has been yet another problem as noted in Billet Item I, i.e. a hole at the junction of the Lower and Upper Berths. This is currently being dealt with at an estimated cost of £100K.

The unforeseen extras are forecast to total £1.4M. However, there have been savings e.g. the use of local stone and shared costs with the contractor, totalling £500K.

If the professional surveys carried out in 2005 and 2007 had revealed these problems, we would have known that the £9.5M budget was too optimistic. However, I must emphasise that the extra costs would not have been avoided. If we can complete the project with a 9% overspend, it will be low for a marine project of this type.

The Lower Berth is due for completion early November, 3 weeks late on an 18 months project.

Considering the problems encountered, I think this is reasonable.

To end on a positive note, when the new quay is finished residents will see an impressive and an incomparably robust structure compared with the old quay. It will be capable of withstanding the worst elements likely to be encountered and have greatly increased working areas.

Finally, the new East Berth created, has successfully berthed the new large generation, larger oil tanker Sarnia Cherie.

Mr Willmott reported on Alderneys attendance at the 40th Annual Conference of the British Islands and Mediterranean Region Commonwealth Parliamentary Association (CPA) held in Guernsey last month. A full copy of the CPA report is available from the Presidents Office and the Government web site. The President reported on the recent visit of Their Royal Highnesses the Earl and Countess of Wessex and the letter of thanks he had received which expressed their appreciation to everyone involved for making their day so special.

The President gave a brief explanation regarding the delayed publication of this months Billet.

Meeting ended: 18:45  
Issued 27th July 2009

---

Uncontrolled Copy - 2012-02-09 03:29:41